Before the FEDERAL COMMUNICATIONS COMMISSION Washington, DC 20554

In the Matter of

Implementation of the Local Competition Provisions in the Telecommunications Act) of 1996

CC Docket No. 96-98

Federal Communications Commission DOCKET FILE COPY ORIGINAL

REPLY TO OPPOSITIONS TO PETITIONS FOR RECONSIDERATION

Time Warner Communications, Inc. (TW Comm), by its attorneys, pursuant to Sections 1.429(g) and 1.4(h) of the Commission's Rules, hereby replies to certain oppositions to TW Comm's petition for reconsideration in this proceeding.

INTRODUCTION

On September 30, 1996, TW Comm filed its petition for reconsideration. As indicated in its petition, TW Comm generally concurs with the rules promulgated by the Commission in the First Report and Order.² TW Comm's petition asks the Commission to reconsider one very important aspect of the First Report and Order -- the methodology to be used by state commissions for the establishment of wholesale rates to be charged by incumbent local exchange carriers (ILECs) to telecommunications carriers for services available for resale. demonstrated in TW Comm's petition, the Commission has improperly converted the standard for establishment of wholesale rates from the statutory standard based upon "avoided costs"³

Ma. of Copies rec'd U+18

¹47 C.F.R. §§1.429(g), 1.4(h).

²Implementation of the Local Competition Provisions in the Telecommunications Act of 1996 (First Report and Order), FCC 96-325, released August 8, 1996 ("First Report and Order").

³47 U.S.C. §252(d)(3). That subsection states as follows:

Time Warner Communications Holdings, Inc.
Reply to Oppositions to Petitions for Reconsideration

November 14, 1996

Page 2

to a very different standard based on what the Commission describes as "reasonably avoidable costs." In fact, as explained by the Commission, the "reasonably avoidable cost" standard is

premised upon a hypothetical set of circumstances that is unlikely ever to exist, *i.e.*, that ILECs

would entirely abandon provision of service at retail to end user customers and provide service

exclusively through resellers.⁵ The economic impact of that conversion is to inflate the

wholesale discount levels far above avoided costs, thereby artificially stimulating inefficient entry

into the local services market through resale.

Several parties, including AT&T Corporation (AT&T), Worldcom, Inc. (Worldcom), and

the Telecommunications Resellers Association (TRA), have opposed TW Comm's petition for

reconsideration. Some of those oppositions misstate the applicable law, others question TW

Comm's motives for seeking reconsideration. None of those opposing parties have provided any

legal basis for denying reconsideration of the appropriate resale pricing standard.

Before addressing specific points raised by parties opposing TW Comm's petition for

reconsideration, TW Comm deems it necessary to reiterate what its petition is about and what

it is not about. TW Comm's petition for reconsideration asks the Commission to properly apply

the statutory standard for establishment of wholesale rates as set forth in Section 252(d)(3) of

For the purposes of Section 251(c)(4), a State commission shall determine wholesale rates on the basis of retail rates charged to subscribers for the telecommunications service requested, excluding the portion thereof attributable to any marketing, billing, collection, and other costs that will be avoided by the local exchange carrier. (emphasis added)

⁴First Report and Order, supra at ¶911.

⁵First Report and Order, supra at ¶911.

Time Warner Communications Holdings, Inc.
Reply to Oppositions to Petitions for Reconsideration

November 14, 1996

Page 3

the Act. Contrary to certain allegations made in opposition pleadings, this dispute is not about

favoring one form of telecommunications competition (facilities-based) over another form of

competition (resale).6 It is not about "protecting [one's] turf."7 It is not about equalizing

competitors' access to capital resources.8

TW Comm concurs with TRA and others that the 1996 Act contemplates multiple forms

of local market entry, and that resale of ILEC services is an important means for local

competitive entry. The resale provisions of the 1996 Act, if properly applied by the

Commission and by state commissions, will achieve the Congressional objective of making

available meaningful opportunities for resale without favoring or disfavoring any form of market

entry and without asking some competitors to subsidize others. In asking for reconsideration,

TW Comm seeks only that the statutory standard for establishing wholesale prices be correctly

applied and that the Commission not adopt rules which result in wholesale pricing of ILEC

services being misused for the purpose of handicapping local competition.

I. The Statutory Language is Unambiguous.

Thus, There is No Need to Look Beyond the Statute to Its Legislative History to Interpret "Avoided Costs."

Moreover, the Legislative History is Fully Consistent with

the Plain Meaning of the Statute

Several parties, including Worldcom, assert that the Commission's interpretation of the

words ". . . costs that will be avoided by the local exchange carrier" as encompassing

⁶TRA reply at 6.

 ^{7}Id .

8*Id*., at 7.

Time Warner Communications Holdings, Inc.
Reply to Oppositions to Petitions for Reconsideration

November 14, 1996

Page 4

"reasonably avoidable costs," is necessary to achieve the statutory purpose of the 1996 Act.9

That argument fails for several reasons. First, there is nothing ambiguous about the language

used by Congress in Section 252(d)(3) to describe the resale at wholesale rate standard. "Costs

that will be avoided" is not a phrase that is reasonably susceptible to more than one

interpretation. A standard dictionary definition of the word "avoid" is as follows: "1. to keep

away from; shun. 2. to keep from happening. 10 By definition, those costs that "will be

avoided" by an ILEC when it sells its services to resellers are those costs which it will not

happen to incur in that situation (selling to resellers). Any additional savings that an ILEC

might realize if it were to totally abandon the retail market are not "avoided" costs within

Section 252(d)(3).

It has long been held that where, as here, statutory language is clear, there is no reason

to look beyond that language to expressions of legislative history, reports, etc. See American

Civil Liberties Union v. FCC, 823 F.2d 1554 (D.C. Cir. 1987). In American Civil Liberties

Union, the court expressly rejected Commission efforts to disregard clear statutory language in

favor of contrary expressions of legislative intent. Those efforts were rejected by the court

which stated as follows:

The Commission asks us to disregard clear statutory language and embrace contraindications found in a committee report, but which are not without ambiguity themselves. Even if the pertinent

passage from the House Report is seen as speaking with complete

clarity, the fact remains that committee reports, even authoritative

⁹Worldcom comments at 22-23.

¹⁰Webster's II New Riverside University Dictionary, Riverside Publishing Company, at 142.

Time Warner Communications Holdings, Inc.
Reply to Oppositions to Petitions for Reconsideration
November 14, 1996
Page 5

committee reports, are not law [cites omitted] . . . We will not permit a committee report to trump clear and unambiguous statutory language.¹¹

As explained by TW Comm in its petition for reconsideration, the statutory requirement that wholesale rates be based on retail rates less only those costs which will be avoided is unambiguous. Thus, there is no need to look to other sources to interpret that requirement. Moreover, the legislative history of Section 252(d)(3) is fully consistent with the statutory language itself. As stated in the Conference Report accompanying the 1996 Act:

The wholesale rate for resold services under new section 251(c)(4) is to be determined by the State commission on the basis of the retail rate charged to subscribers of such telecommunications services, excluding costs that will be avoided by the incumbent carrier. 12

Conspicuously absent from the legislative history is any language supporting the strained interpretations of the avoided cost standard that proponents of the Commission's reasonably avoidable test would attribute to Congress. Nothing in the legislative history indicates that wholesale discounts should be inflated beyond costs actually to be avoided by ILECs in order to stimulate resale competition. Nothing in the legislative history indicates that prices for resold services are to be based upon a "fiction" of total ILEC exit from the retail services marketplace - a most improbable scenario. Indeed, if the purpose for the wholesale rate based on avoided cost standard is to provide an opportunity for competition to ILEC services through resale, it

¹¹823 F.2d at 1569. <u>See also West Virginia University Hospitals, Inc. v. Casey</u>, 111 S. Ct. 1138 (1991); <u>Consumer Product Safety Commission v. GTE Sylvania, Inc., et al</u>, 447 U.S. 102. (1980).

¹²H.R. Conf. Rep. No. 458, 104th Cong., 2d Sess. at 126 (1996) (emphasis added).

makes no sense to base the wholesale price of the resold ILEC services on an assumption that the ILEC no longer will be a competitor for providing services to retail customers.

II. Proper Application of the Avoided Cost Standard Does Not Preclude Use of Forward Looking Costs

Another criticism of TW Comm's petition for reconsideration is that literal application of the statutory "costs that will be avoided" standard would enable ILECs to forestall resale competition by refusing to shed retail costs when selling to resellers.¹³ That is incorrect. In asserting that the "avoided cost" standard should reflect only costs not incurred in selling to resellers, TW Comm neither stated nor implied that forward looking avoided cost studies could not be used. If it is demonstrated to a state commission that an ILEC will not have to incur certain specific costs in selling services to resellers, such avoided costs are properly excludable in calculating the wholesale rates for those services under Section 252(d)(3).

TW Comm's criticism of the Commission's interpretation of the avoided cost standard is not that forward looking cost studies should not be used, but rather that, under the Commission's methodology, the basis for excluding costs from wholesale rates has nothing to do with cost avoidance by ILECs in selling to wholesale customers. Rather, it is based upon abdication of the retail market by the ILEC.

Similarly, TRA objects to TW Comm's account-by-account critique of the Commission's identification of specific cost accounts from the Uniform System of Accounts (USOA)¹⁴ as

¹³Worldcom comments at 22.

¹⁴47 C.F.R. Part 32.

Time Warner Communications Holdings, Inc.

Reply to Oppositions to Petitions for Reconsideration

November 14, 1996

Page 7

containing presumptively avoidable costs. TRA refers to this account-by-account analysis as a

"meaningless exercise." First, the decision to base the rules for avoided cost studies on the

"meaningless exercise" of identifying specific costs accounts from the USOA was not TW

Comm's idea, it was the Commission's. Presumably, the Commission elected to utilize

USOA accounts in identifying avoided costs based upon a belief that certain accounting

categories could be shown to contain costs which are avoided when service is provided to

wholesale customers rather than retail customers. TW Comm deemed it necessary to engage

in this "meaningless exercise" because it believes that certain of the accounts noted by the

Commission as being presumptively avoided by ILECs in providing wholesale services contain

costs which are indeed incurred by ILECs in selling service in wholesale markets as well as

retail markets. Given the fact that the statutory requirement is that wholesale rates be based on

retail rates excluding only costs "that will be avoided," proper identification by state regulators

of avoided costs is imperative in order to establish wholesale rates which comply with the

standard codified at Section 252(d)(3). Whatever mechanisms are established by the

Commission for conducting avoided cost studies, those studies must be done properly. Avoided

cost studies based on USOA accounts which contain costs that are not avoided in selling in

wholesale markets would not meet that standard.

AT&T asserts that wholesale rates which include portions of advertising and marketing

¹⁵TRA reply at 9.

¹⁶First Report and Order, supra at ¶917-920.

Time Warner Communications Holdings, Inc. Reply to Oppositions to Petitions for Reconsideration November 14, 1996

Page 8

costs could "compel new entrants to underwrite the ILECs' retail marketing efforts." This is incorrect. TW Comm's critique of the Commission's analysis of USOA accounts was based on a very simple proposition — a proposition which either is lost on AT&T or which is intentionally being ignored by AT&T: certain portions of the costs in those USOA accounts are, in fact, incurred by ILECs in their provision of wholesale service to resellers, and therefore, should be included in wholesale rates. Those costs are <u>not</u> entirely associated with retail sales. To suggest, as AT&T does, that inclusion of portions of cost accounts to wholesale operations in the rates for those wholesale services somehow constitutes subsidization of ILEC retail activities reflects a thorough disregard for the avoided cost standard codified at Section 252(d)(3). ¹⁸

III. TW Does Not Object to Resellers (or Any Other Local Service Competitors) Providing Their Own Operator or Directory Assistance Services

AT&T and TRA incorrectly accuse TW Comm of requesting that resellers be prohibited from providing their own operator or directory assistance services.¹⁹ This is absolutely

¹⁷AT&T opposition at 27-28.

¹⁸Neither does AT&T's strained attempt to distinguish marketing and advertising costs incurred in the wholesale computer chip market from marketing and advertising costs incurred in the wholesale telecommunications services market (AT&T opposition at 28 n. 41) bear any relevance to the proper application of the Section 252(d)(3) avoided cost standard. Whether or not ILECs "directly compete" with resellers, they still market their services to resellers, and incur costs in serving resellers. Those costs are properly includable in wholesale rates under Section 252(d)(3). Contrary to AT&T's assertion, resellers are, indeed, distributors of their vendors' services.

¹⁹AT&T opposition at 26, TRA reply at 12-14.

Time Warner Communications Holdings, Inc.
Reply to Oppositions to Petitions for Reconsideration
November 14, 1996
Page 9

However, there is a difference between purchasing an ILEC <u>service</u> for resale at wholesale rates on the one hand, and providing a service through purchase of ILEC unbundled network elements on the other hand. To base avoided cost discounts on the premise that resellers would obtain certain elements of ILEC services separately, either from the ILEC as unbundled network elements, or from another source, ignores the distinction between purchasing a <u>service</u> at a wholesale rate for resale and purchasing network elements to create one's own service.²²

²⁰First Report and Order, supra at ¶917.

²¹47 U.S.C. §251(c)(3).

²²AT&T claims that customers view operator and directory assistance services separately from basic local dialtone (AT&T opposition at 26 n. 37). That may be so. However, Section 251((c)(4) does not provide for resale of basic local dialtone. Rather, it requires ILECs to offer

Time Warner Communications Holdings, Inc.
Reply to Oppositions to Petitions for Reconsideration
November 14, 1996
Page 10

CONCLUSION

For all of the foregoing reasons as well as those articulated by TW Comm in its petition for reconsideration, TW Comm respectfully urges the Commission to modify its regulations for avoided cost studies as required by Section 252(d)(3) of the Act as set forth in its petition for reconsideration.

Respectfully submitted,

TIME WARNER COMMUNICATIONS HOLDINGS, INC.

Mitchell F. Brecher

FLEISCHMAN AND WALSH, L.L.P. 1400 Sixteenth Street, NW Washington, DC 20036 (202) 939-7900

Its Attorneys

November 14, 1996

46656.1/0664

for resale at wholesale rates "any telecommunications <u>service</u> that the carrier provides at retail to subscribers who are not telecommunications carriers" (emphasis added). Where ILEC retail services include on a bundled basis operator and directory assistance functions (*i.e.*, where those functions are included in the service rate and are not subject to separate charges), the service made available on a wholesale basis for resale must be the same service, including those features, as the service provided to retail customers. The purpose for the unbundled network requirement of Section 251(c)(3) is to enable competitors to utilize ILEC networks to compete without reselling ILEC "services."

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I, Antoinette R. Mebane, hereby certify that on this 14th day of November, 1996 copies of the foregoing *Reply to Oppositions to Petitions for Reconsideration of Time Warner Communications Holdings, Inc.* CC Docket 96-98 were served to the parties listed on the attached service list.

Antoinette R. Mebane

Dated: November 14, 1996

44848.1/0664

SERVICE LIST

VIA HAND DELIVERY

Honorable Reed E. Hundt Chairman Federal Communications Commission 1919 M Street, NW Room 814 Washington, DC 20554

Commissioner James H. Quello Federal Communications Commission 1919 M Street, NW Room 802 Washington, DC 20554

Commissioner Rachelle B. Chong Federal Communications Commission 1919 M Street, NW Room 844 Washington, DC 20554

Commissioner Susan Ness Federal Communications Commission 1919 M Street, NW Room 832 Washington, DC 20554

Regina Keeney Chief, Common Carrier Bureau Federal Communications Commission 1919 M Street, NW Room 500 Washington, DC 20554

James D. Schlichting
Chief, Competitive Pricing Division
Federal Communications Commission
1919 M Street, N.W
Room 518
Washington, DC

VIA REGULAR MAIL

Robert M. Lynch Durward D. Dupre Mary W. Marks Southwestern Bell Company One Bell Center, Room 3536 St. Louis, Missouri 63101 Daniel Brenner
Neal M. Goldberg
David L. Nicoll
National Cable Television Association
1724 Massachusetts Avenue, NW
Washington, DC 20036-1969

Emily M. Williams
Association for Local
Telecommunications Services
1200 19th Street, NW
Washington, DC 20036

Mark C. Rosenblum
Roy E. Hoffinger
Clifford K. Williams
AT&T Corp.
295 North Maple Avenue
Room 3252F2
Basking Ridge, New Jersey 07920

Charles C. Hunter Catherine M. Hannan Hunter & Mow, P.C. 1620 I Street, NW, Suite 701 Washington, DC 20006

Lawrence G. Malone New York State Department of Public Service Three Empire State Plaza Albany, NY 12223-3510

Diane Munns
General Counsel
Iowa Utilities Board
Lucas State Office Building
Des Moines, Iowa 50319

Mark D. Roellig Dan L. Poole Robert B. McKenna 1020 19th St., NW, Suite 700 Washington, DC 20036

Brian A. Eddington Louisianna Public Service Commission P.O. Box 91154 Baton Rouge, LA 70821-9154 John Strand Michigan PSC 6545 Mercantile Way Lansing, MI 48910

Douglas E. Hart Jack B. Harrison Frost & Jacobs 2500 PNC Center 201 East Fifth Street Cincinnati, OH 45202

Allan Kniep
Deputy General Counsel
Iowa Utilities Board
Lucas State Office Building
Des Moines, Iowa 50319

Paul T. Cappuccio Steven G. Bradbury Patrick Philbin Kirkland & Ellis 655 15th St., NW, Suite 1200 Washington, DC 20005

Don Schroer, Chairman Alaska PUC 1015 West Sixth Ave., Suite 400 Anchorage, AK 99501

Joseph W. Waz Jr. Comcast Corporation 1500 Market Street Philadelphia, PA 19102

Douglas Povich Kelly & Povich, PC 1101-30th St., NW, Suite 300 Washington, DC 20007

David MGann Myra Karegianes Illinois Commerce Commission 160 North LA Salle St. Suite C-800 Chicago, IL 60601

Christopher W. Savage David C. Haghighi Cole Raywid & Braverman, LLP 1919 Pennsylvania Ave., NW Suite 200 Washington, DC 20006 Joseph R. Reifer John D. Seiver 1919 Pennsylvania Ave., NW Suite 200 Washington, DC 20006

Jennifer Simpson United Cerebral Palsy Association 1522 K Street, NW, Suite 1112 Washington, DC 20036

Robert J. Hix Vincent Majkowski Colorado Public Utilities Commission 1580 Logan Street, Office Level 2 Denver, CO 80203

Jonathan E. Canis Reed Smith Shaw & McClay 1301 K Street, NW Suite 1100 East Tower Washington, DC 20005 Michael S. Fox John Staurlakis Inc. 6315 Seabrook Road Seabrook, MD 20706

Ronald Binz
Debra Berlyn
Competition Policy Institute
1156 15th St., NW, Suite 310
Washington, DC 20005

Richard G. Morgan Richard A. Drom Lane & Mihendorf LLP 919 18th Street, NW, Suite 800 Washington, DC 20006

Christopher J. Wright Federal Communications Commission 1919 M Street, NW, Room 614 Washington, DC 20554

Terrency P. McGarty Comav Corp. 60 State St., 22nd Floor Boston, MA 02109

William E. Kennard Federal Communications Commission 1919 M St., NW, Room 614 Washington, DC 20554 Susan Drombetta
Scherers Communications Group, Inc.
575 Scherers Court
Worthington, OH 43085

Robert B. Nicholson Robert J. Wiggers US Department of Justice 10th & Pennsylvania Ave., NW Room 3224 Washington, DC 20530

Theodore V. Morrison, Jr. Virginia State Corporation Commission 1300 East Main Street Richmond, VA 23219

Antoinette Cook Bush Linda G. Morrison Skadden Arps Slate Meagher & Flom 1400 New York Avenue, NW Washington, DC 20005

Anthony C. Epstein Donald Verrilli Maureen F. Del Duca Jenner and Block 601 13th Street, NW Washington, DC 20005

Thomas P. Hester Kelly R. Welsh John T. Lenahan Ameritech Operating Companies 30 South Wacker Drive Chicago, IL 60606

R. Michael Senkowski Richard E. Wiley Jeffery S. Linder Wiley Rein & Fielding 1776 K Street, NW Washington, DC 20006

Pat Wood III Robert W. Gee Judy Walsh Laurie Pappas Texas PUC, Suite 290-E 7800 Shoal Creek Blvd. Austin, TX 78757 Bruce Hagen
Susan E. Wefald
Leo M. Reinbold
North Dakota PSC
State Capitol, 12th Floor
Bismarck, ND 58505-0480

Philip L. Malet Alfred Mamlet Colleen A. Sechrest Steptoe & Johnson LLP 1330 Connecticut Avenue, NW Washington, DC 20036

James U Troup L. Charles Keller Arter & Hadden 1801 K Street, NW, Suite 400K Washington, DC 20006

Encarnita Catalan-Marchan Maria Pizarro-Figueroa Telfonica Larga Distancia De Puerto Rico, Inc. Matro Office Part Building No. 8, Street No. 1 Guaynabo, PR 00922

Tim Raven
Texas Telephone Association
400 West 15th Street, Suite 1005
Austin, TX 78701-1647

William P. Barr Ward W. Wueste, Jr. Gail L. Polivy GTE Service Corporation 1850 M St., NW, Suite 1200 Washington, DC 20036

Jim Whitefield
Gary L. Mann
Texas Statewide Telephone Ative, Inc.
3721 Executive Center Drive
Suite 200
Austin, TX 78731-1639

Richard A. Finnigan
Washington Independent
Telephone Association, Suite B-1
2405 Evergreen Park Dr., SW
Olympia, WA 98502

Steve Hamlen Unicom 5450 A Street Anchorage, AK 99518-1291

Danny E. Adams
John J. Heitman
Steven A. Augustino
Kelly, Drye & Warren LLP
1200 19th St., NW, Suite 500
Washington, DC 20036

Joe D. Carpenter, Jr.
Telecommunications Industry Ass'n
1201 Pennsylvania Ave., NW, Suite 315
Washington, DC 20044-0407

Wayne V. Black
C. Douglas Jarrett
Susan M. Hafeli
Keller & Heckman
1001 G St., NW, Suite 500 West
Washington, DC 20001

John B. Howe
Mary Clark
Janet Gail Besser
The Commonwealth of Massachusetts
Department of Public Utilities
100 Cambridge St., 12th Floor
Boston, MA 02202

Elizabeth R. Sachs Lukas, McGowan, Nace & Gutierrez 1111 19th St., NW, 12th Floor Washington, DC 20036

Scott Harshbarger
Daniel Mitchell
Attorney Generals Office of the
Commonwealth of Massachusetts
200 Portland St., 4th Floor
Boston, MA 02114

Alan R. Shark
American Mobile Telecommunications
Association, Inc.
1150 18th St., NW, Suite 250
Washington, DC 20036

Rachael J. Rothstein Ann P. Morton Cable & Wireless, Inc. 8219 Leesburg Pike Vienna, VA 22182 Joel B. Shifman Main Public Utilities Commission 242 State St. State House Station No. 18 Augusta, ME 04333-0018

Lowell C. Johnson Nebraska PSC 1200 N Street, 300 the Atrium POB 94927 Lincoln, NE 68509-4927

Michael L. Ginsberg Assistant Attorney General 160 East 300 South POB 146751 Salt Lake City, UT 84145

Karen Finstad Hammel Montana PSC 1701 Prospect Ave., POB 202601 Helena, MT 59620-2601

Stephen Mecham UTAH PSC 160 East 300 South POB 45585 Salt Lake City, UT 84145

Rolayne Ailts South Dakota PUC 500 East Capital Pierre, SD 57501

David Kaufman
New Mexico State Corporation
Commission
POB 1269
Santa Fe, NM 87504-1269

George E. Young Vermont PSB Draw 20 Montelier, VT 05620-2701

E. Barclay Jackson New Hampshire PUC 8 Old Suncook Road Concord, NH 03301-7319

Sheldon M. Katz Vermont Dept. of PS Drawer 20 Montpelier, VT 05620-2601 Thomas E. Taylor
Jack B. Harrison
Frost & Jacobs
2500 Central Trust Center
201 East Fifth Street
Cincinnati, OH 45202

Philip L. Verveer
Jennifer A. Donaldson
Angie Kronenberg
Willkie Farr & Gallagher
Three Lafayette Ctr.
1155 21st St., NW, Suite 600
Washington, DC 20036-3384

Christopher C. Kempley
Deborah R. Scott
Arizona Corporation Commission
1200 West Washington Street
Phoenix, AZ 85007

Martha S. Hogerty NASUCA 1133 15th St., NW, Suite 550 Washington, DC 20005

Ann Kutter
Douglas Elfner
New York State Consumer
Protection Board
99 Washington Ave.
Albany, NY 12210

Margaret E. Garber Pacific Telesis Group 1275 Pennsylvania Ave., NW 4th Floor Washington, DC 20004

Bradley Stillman Mark N. Cooper Consumer Federation of America 1424 16th St, NW, Suite 604 Washington, DC 20036

David W. Carpenter Peter D. Keisler David L. Lawson David M. Levy Sidley & Austin One First National Plaza Chicago, IL 60603 Michael F. Altschul Randall S. Coleman Cellular Telecommunications Industry 1250 Connecticut Ave., NW, Ste. 200 Washington, DC 20036

Mark C. Rosenblum Richard H. Rubin AT&T Corp. 295 North Maple Ave., Room 324511 Basking Ridge, NJ 07920

Marlin D. Ard Randall E. Cape John W. Bogy Pacific Telesis Group 140 New Montgomery St. Room 1530A San Francisco, CA 94105

Saul Fisher
William J. Balcerski
NYNEX Corporation
1111 Westchester Avenue
White Plains, NY 10604

J. Manning Lee
Teresa Marrero
Teleport Communications Group, Inc.
Two Teleport Drive, Suite 300
Staten Island, NY 10311

Michael E. Glover Leslie A. Vial James G. Pachylski Lydia Pulley Bell Atlantic Telephone Companies 1320 North Court House Rd., 8th Floor Arlington, VA 22201

Brad E. Mutschelknaus Steve A. Augustino Marienann Zochowski Kelley Drye & Watten, LLP 1200 19th St., NW, Suite 500 Washington, DC 20036

Glen A. Schmiege Mark J. Burzych Foster Swift Collins & Smith PC 303 South Washington Square Lansing, MI 48933 Robert S. Tongren Ohio consumers Council 77 South High St., 15th Floor Columbus, OH 43266-0550

Timothy R. Graham Robert M. Berger Joseph M. Sandri, Jr. Winstar Communications, Inc. 1146 19th St., NW Washington, DC 20036

Charles C. Hunter Hunter & Mow, PC 1620 I St., NW, Suite 701 Washington, DC 20006

Anne K. Bingaman Donald J. Russell Luin Fitch US Department of Justice 555 4th St., NW, Room 8104 Washington, DC 20001

Betty D. Montgomery Steven T. Nourse PUC of Ohio 180 East Broad Street Columbus, OH 43266-0573

Jeffrey L. Sheldon Sean A. Stokes Utilities Telecommunications Council 140 Connecticut Ave., NW, Ste. 1140 Washington, DC 20036

Reginald J. Smith
Connecticut Department of
Public Utility Control
10 Franklin Square
New Britain, CT 06051

Robert S. Foosaner Nextel Communications, Inc. 800 Connecticut Ave., NW, Ste. 1001 Washington, DC 20006

Cindy Schonhaut Intelcom Group (USA), Inc. 9605 East Maroon Circle Englewood, CO 80112 Peter A. Rohrbach Linda Oliver Kyle D. Dixon Hogan & Hartson, LLP 555 13th St., NW Washington, DC 20004

Albert H. Kramer Robert F. Aldrich Dickstein Shapiro & Morin, LLP 2101 L Street, NW, Suite 800 Washington, DC 20037-1526

Stephen L. Goodman Halprin Temple Goodman & Sugrue 1100 New York, Ave., NW Suite 650 East Washington, DC 20005

Eric E. Breisach Christopher C. Cinnamon Howard & Howard 107 West Michigan Ave., Suite 400 Kalamazoo, MI 49007

Maureen A. Scott Veronica A. Smith John F. Povalaitis Pennsylvania PUC POB 3265 Harrisburg, PA 17105-3265

Steve Ellenbecker Kristin H. Lee Wyoming PSC 700 West 21st Street Cheyenne, WY 82002

Jere W. Glover David W. Zesiger United States Small Business Administration 409 3rd St., SW Washington, DC 20416

John G. Lamb, Jr.
Northern Telecom, Inc.
2100 Lakewide Blvd.
Richardson, TX 75081-1599

Rodney L. Joyce J. Thomas Nolan Henry M. Rivera Ginsburg Feldman and Bress 1250 Connecticut Ave., NW 8th Floor Washington, DC 20036

James Eibel Network Reliability Council II Secretariat 7613 William Penn Place indianapolis, IN 46256

Mark Golden
Personal Communications
Industry Association
500 Montgomery St., Suite 700
Alexandria, VA 22314-1561

Stephen R. Rosen Theodore M. Weitz Lucent Technologies, Inc. 475 South Street Morristown, NJ 07962-1976

Genevieve Morelli Competitive Telecommunications Association 1140 Connecticut Ave., NW Washington, DC 20036

Emily C. Hewitt Vincent L. Crivella Michael J. Ettner General Services Administration 18th and F St., NW, Room 4002 Washington, DC 20405

Robert J. Aamoth Judith St. Ledger-Roty Reed Smith Shaw & McClay 1301 K Street, NW, Suite 1100E Washington, DC 20005-3317

Madelyn Dematteo Alfred J. Brunetti Maura C. Bollinger Southern New England Telephone Company 227 Church Street New Haven, CT 06510-1806 Leon M. Kestenbaum
Jay C. Keithley
H. Richard Juhnke
Sprint Communications Company, Inc.
1850 M Street, NW
Washington, DC 20036

Cynthia Miller
Florida Public Service Commission
2540 Shumard Oak Blvd.
Tallahassee, FL 32399-0850

William H. Smith, Jr. Allan Kniep Iowa Utilities Board Lucas State Office Building Des Moines, IA 50319

Veronica M Ahern Mixon Hartgrove Devans & Doyle One Thomas Circle, Suite 800 Washington, DC 20005

Robert Kittel
Cecil O. Simpson, Jr.
Office of the Judge Advocate General
901 North Stuart St., Suite 713
Arlington, VA 22203-1837

Colleen Boothby Levine Blaszak Block and Boothby 1300 Connecticut Ave., NW, Ste. 500 Washington, DC 20036-1703

Pamela Riley Airtouch Communications, Inc. One California Street San Francisco, CA 94111

Paul J. Berman Alane C. Weixel Jonathan D. Blake Covington & Burling 1201 Pennsylvania Ave., NW POB 7566 Washington, DC 20044-7566

David A. Gross
Kathleen Q. Abernathy
Airtouch Communications Inc.
1818 N Street, NW, Suite 800
Washington, DC 20036

Snavely King Majoros O'Connor & Lee Inc. 1220 L Street, NW Washington, DC 20005

Charles H. Helein Helein & Associates PC 8180 Greensboro Dr., Suite 700 McLean, VA 22102

Anne P. Schelle American Personal Communications 6901 Rockledge Dr., Suite 600 One Democracy Center Bethesda, MD 20817

Mark J. Palchick Stephen M. Howard Vorys Sater Seymour & Pease 1828 L Street, NW, Suite 1111 Washington, DC 20036

Robert A. Hart IV Hart Engineers POB 66436 Baton Rouge, LA 708976

James Baller
Lana Meller
The Baller Law Group
1820 Jefferson Pl., NW, Ste. 200
Washington, DC 20036

Robert A. Hart IV Hart Engineers POB 66436 Baton Rouge LA 70896

James Baller
Lana Meller
The Baller Law Group
1820 Jefferson Pl., NW, Suite 200
Washington, DC 20036

Nicholas Economides Stern School of Business New York University, NY 10012

Harold Crumpton Missouri PSC POB 360 Jefferson City, MO 65102 Marc A. Stone
Fred Williamson & Associates Inc.
2921 East 91st St., Suite 200
Tulsa, OK 74137-3300

Mary E. Newmeyer John Garner Alabama PSC 100 North Union St., POB 991 Montgomery, AL 36101

John T. Scott III Corwell & Moring 1001 Pennsylvania Ave., NW Washington, DC 20004

Richard N. Kock 10 Lilac Street Sharon, MA 02067

David Jatlow Young & Jatlow 2300 N St., NW, Suite 600 Washington, DC 20037

Michael Shortley III Frontier Corporation 180 South Clinton Ave. Rochester, NY 124646

Roy L. Morris Frontier Communications Services, Inc. 1990 M Street, NW, Suite 500 Washington, DC 20036

Kathy L. Shobert General Communication, Inc. 901 15th St., NW, Suite 900 Washington, DC 20005

Lee M. Weiner
Douglas W. Kinkoph
LCI International Telecommunications
Corporation
8180 Greensboro Drive, Suite 800
McLean, VA 22102

Greg Berberich Matanuska Telephone Association, Inc. 1740 South Chugach St. Palmer, AK 99645 Richard Tettelbaum Citizens Utilities Company 1400 16th St., NW, Suite 500 Washington, DC 20036

BB Knowles
Dave Baker
Georgia PSC
244 Washington St., SW
Atlanta, GA 30334-5701

Amy Dougherty PSC of Kentucky 730 Schenkel Lane POB 615 Frankfort, KY 40602

Robert A. Mazer Albert Shuldiner Mary Pape Vinson & Elkins 1455 Pennsylvania Ave., NW Washington, DC 20004-1008

Bryan G. Moorhouse Susa Stevens Miller Maryland PSC 6 St. Paul Street Baltimore, MD 21202

Kevin C. Gallagher 360 Communications Company 8725 West Higgins Road Chicago, IL 60631

Barbara O'Connor Mary Gardiner Jones Henry Geller Alliance for Public Technology 901 15th St., NW, Suite 230 Washington, DC 20005

Carolyn C. Hill Alltel Telephone Services Corp. 655 15th St., NW, Suite 220 Washington, DC 20005

Earl Pace BDPA 1250 Connecticut Ave., NW, Suite 610 Washington, DC 20036

Winston Pittman Chrysler Minority Dealers Association 27777 Franklin Rd., Suite 1105 Southfield, MI 48034 J. Christopher Dane Kerry Tassopoulos Excel Telecommunications, inc. 9330 LBJ Freeway, Suite 1220 Dallas, TX 75243

Curtis T. White Allied Associated Partners LP and Geld Information Systems 4201 Connecticut Ave., NW, Ste. 402 Washington, DC 20008-1158

Bettye Gardner
The Association for the Study
of Afro American Life & History Inc.
1407 14th St., NW
Washington, DC 20005-3704

Timothy E. Welch Hill and Welch 1330 New Hampshire Ave., NW Suite 113 Washington, DC 20036

Gerald M. Zuckerman
Edward B. Myers
Communications and Energy Dispute
Resolution Associates
International Square, Suite 400
1825 I Street, NW
Washington, DC 20006

Thomas K. Crowe Law Offices of Thomas K. Crowe PC 2300 M Street, NW, Suite 800 Washington, DC 20037

Maudine R. Cooper Greater Washington Urban League Inc. 3501 14th St., NW Washington, DC 20010

Gene P. Belardi Mobilemedia Communications Inc. 2101 Wilson Blvd., Suite 935 Arlington, VA 22201

Nebraska Rural Development Commission POB 94666 Lincoln, NE 68509-4666

Daniel M. Waggoner Davis Wright Tremaine 1501 Fourth Avenue 2600 Century Square Seattle, WA 98101-1688 David Heinemann
Julie Thomas Bowles
Kansas Corporation Commission
1500 SW Arrowheard Road
Topeaka, KS 66604

James N. Horwood Scott H. Strauss Wendy S. Lader Speigel & McDiarmid 1350 New York Ave., NW, Suite 1100 Washington, DC 20005-4798

John Crump National Bar Association 1225 11th Street, NW Washington, DC 20001-4217

J. Scott Bonney Nextlink Communications, LLC 155 108th Avenue, NE Bellevue, WA 98004

Jonathan M. Chambers Sprint Spectrum LP 1801 K Street, NW Suite M-112 Washington, DC 20036

Gloria Tristani
Jerome Block
Eric Serna
New Mexico State Corporation
Commission
PO Drawer 1269
Santa Fe, NM 87504-1269

Perry W. Woofter United Calling Network, Inc. 1200 29th St., NW, Suite 200 Washington, DC 20007

Charles H. Kennedy Morrison & Foerster LLP 2000 Pennsylvania Ave., NW Suite 5500 Washington, DC 20006

Joe D. Edge Richard J. Arsenault Tina M. Pidgeon Drinker Biddle & Reath 901 15th Street, NW Washington, DC 20005 Margot Smiley Humphrey Koteen & Naftalin 1150 Connecticut Ave., NW, Ste 1000 Washington, DC 20036

Chris Barron TCA, Inc. 3617 Betty Drive, Suite 1 Colorado Springs, CO 80917

CJ Cain Utilex, Inc. POB 991 Greenville, NC 27834

Dwight E. Zimmerman
Illinois Independent Telephone Association
RR 13, 24B Oakmont Road
Bloomington, IL 61794
George Petrutsas
Paul J. Feldman
Fletcher Heald & Hildreth PLC
11th Floor
1300 North 17th Street
Rosslyn, VA 22209

David Cosson
L. Marie Guillory
Steven E. Watkins
National Telephone Cooperative
Association
2626 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW
Washington, DC 20037

Joanne Salvatore Bochis National Exchange Carrier Assoc. 100 South Jefferson Road Whippany, NJ 07981

Mark J. Tauber Mark J. O'Connor Piper & Marbury LLP 7th Floor 1200 19th Street, N.W. Washington, D.C. 20036

Robert J. Hix Vincent Majkowski Colorado PUC Office Level 2 1580 Logan Street Denver, CO 80203 Richard J. Metzger Emily M. Williams Association For Local Telecommunications Services Suite 560 1200 19th Street, N.W. Washington, D.C. 20036

Brian R. Moir Moir & Hardman Suite 512 2000 L Street, N.W. Washington, D.C. 20036-4907

Ernest G. Johnson John Gray Maribeth Snapp Oklahoma Corp. Commission POB 25000-2000 Oklahoma City, OK 73152-2000

Jerome K. Blask
Daniel E. Smith
Gurman Blask & Freedman, Chartered
Suite 500
1400 16th Street, N.W.
Washington, DC 20036

James A. Hirshfield Summit Communications, Inc. Suite 107 3633 136th Place Southeast Bellevue, WA 98006

Mark McDermott Linda Kent Charles D. Cosson Keith Townsend USTA Suite 600 1401 H Street, N.W. Washington, D.C. 20005

Carl W. Northreop Christine M. Crowe Paul Hastings Janofsky & Walker 10th Floor 1299 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W. Washington, D.C. 20004-2400

Lisa M. Zaina Ken Johnson Opastco Suite 700 21 DuPont Circle, N.W. Washington, D.C. 20036 Reginald R. Bernard SDN Users Association, Inc. POB 4014 Bridgewater, NJ 08807

Robert C. Schoonmaker GVNW Inc./Management POB 25969 Colorado Springs, CO 80936

Fiona Branton Information Technology Industry Council 1250 Eye Street, N.W. Washington, D.C. 20005

Charles D. Gray james Bradford Ramsay NARUC 1102 ICC Building POB 684 Washington, D.C. 20044

R. Glenn Rhyne State of South Carolina PSC POB 11649 Columbia, SC 29211

Rebecca S. Weeks
Carl Wayne Smith
Defense Information Systems Agency
701 South Courthouse Road
Arlington, VA 22204

Robert Glazier
Indiana Utility Regulatory Commission
Indiana Government Center South
Suite E-306
302 West Washington
Indianapolis, IN 46204

Richard Johnson Michael Bradley Moss & Barnett 90 South 7th Street 4800 Northwest Center Minneapolis, MN 55401-4129

Robert P. Gruber Antoinette R. Wike North Carolina Utilities Commission 430 North Salisbury Street POB 29520 Raleigh, NC 27626-0520 Thomas R. Gibbon Charles Z. Zielinski Anthony M. Black Bell Boyd & Lloyd Suite 1200 1615 L Street, N.W. Washington, D.C. 20036

Philip E. Batt Idaho PUC 472 West Washington Street Boise, ID 83702

Daniel L. Brenner
Neal M. Goldberg
David L. Nicoll
National Cable Television
Association, Inc.
1724 Massachusetts Avenue, N.W.
Washington, D.C. 20036

Bridger Mitchell Charles River Associates, Inc. Suite 370 285 Hamilton Avenue Palo Alto, CA 94301

Brenda L. Fox Continental Cablevision, Inc. Suite 201 1320 19th Street, N.W. Washington, D.C. 20036

Lawrence D. Crocker III

Public Service Commission of the
District of Columbia

450 5th Street, N.W.

Washington, D.C. 20001

Carol Weinhaus
Telecommunications Industries
Analysis Project
University of Florida College of
Business Administration
121 Mt. Vernon Street
Boston, MA 02108

Howard J. Symons
Frank W. Lloyd
Cherie R. Kiser
Donna Lampert
Mintz Levin Cohn Ferris Glavsky
& Popeo, P.C.
Suite 900
701 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W.
Washington, D.C. 20004

Robert J. Sacks Howard B. Homonoff Continental Cablevision, inc. Lewis Whaft Pilot House Boston, MA 02110

Leonard S. Sawicki
Don Sussman
Larry Fenter
Charles Goldfarb
MCI Telecommunications Corporation
1801 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W.
Washington, D.C. 20006

Mark L. Evans
Michael K. Kellogg
Howard Shelanski
Kellog Huber Hansen Todd
& Evans, PLLC
Suite 1000 West
1301 K Street, N.W.
Washington, D.C. 20005

Lawrence St. Blanc Gayle T. Kellner Louisiana PSC POB 91154 Baton Rouge, LA 70821-9154

Peter Arth, Jr.
Edward W. O'Neil
Mark Mack Aud
Attorneys For The People of The State
Of California And The PUC Of The State
of California
505 Van Ness Avenue
San Francisco, CA 94102

Roger Hamilton Ron Eachus W. Benny Won Public Utility Section Oregon Department of Justice 1162 Court Street, N.E. Salem, OR 97310

Alan Dinsmore America Foundation For The Blind 1615 M Street, N.W. Suit 250 Washington, D.C. 20036 Earle H. O'Donnell Laurel W. Glassman Dewey Ballantine 1775 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W. Washington, D.C. 20006

Norman D. Rasmussen Colorado Independent Telephone Assoc. 43236 Hiwan Drive Evergreen, CO 80439

M. Robert Sutherland Richard M. Sbaratta A. Kirven Gilber BellSouth 1155 Eachtree Street, N.E. Suite 1700 Atlanta, GA 30309-3610

Marlin D. Ard Randall E. Cape John W. Bogy Pacific Telesis Group 140 Montgomery Street, Room 1530 15th Floor San Francisco, CA 94105

Paul Shroeder AFB Midwest 401 N. Michigan Avenue Suite 308 Chicago, IL 60611

Eric Witte Missouri PSC POB 360 Jefferson City, MO 65102

H. Keith Oliver Home Telephone Company, Inc. 200 Tram Street Moncks, SC 29461

Anthony Petrilla Mark Albert Andrew Lipman Robert McKenna US West, Inc. 1020 19th Street, N.W. Suite 600 Washington, D.C. 20036 Robert J. Sachs Howard B. Homonoff Continental Cablevision, Inc. 1320 19th Street, N.W. Suite 201 Washington, D.C. 20036

Terrence M. Baun
Dane E. Ericksen
Christopher D. Imlay
Booth Feret & Imlay
Attorney For Society of
Broadcast Engineers, Inc.
1233 20th Street, N.W.
Suite 204
Washington, D.C. 20036

Edward C. Addisoin Virginia State Corporation Commission Division of Communications POB 1197 Richmond, VA 23218

Roy M. Neel Bob Boaldin Russell Blair Douglas G. Bonner Swider & Berlin, Chartered 3000 K Street, N.W. Suite 300 Washington, D.C. 20007

Weldon B. Stutzman Idaho Public Utilities Commission POBX 83720-0074 Boise, Idaho 83720-0074

Veronica M. Ahem Nixon Hargrave Devans & Doyle, LLP Attorney for Guam Telephone Authority One Thomas Circle, N.W. Suite 800 Washington, D.C. 20005

Stephen G. Oxley State of Wyoming PSC 700 W. 21st Street Cheyenne, WY 82002

General Counsel
Federal Communications Commission
1919 M Street, N.W.
Washington, D.C. 20554

Jordan Clerk United Homeowners Association 1511 K Street, N.W. Washington, D.C. 20005

Edwards Hayes, Jr., Esq. 1155 Connecticut Avenue, N.W. Third Floor Washington, D.C. 20036

Saul Fisher
Joseph DiBella
NYNEX Corporation
Suite 400 West
1300 I Street, N.W.
Washington, D.C. 20005

James Rowe Alaska Telephone Association 4341 B Street Suite 304 Anchorage, AK 99503

Dixie Horning
Executive Director
Gary Panthers
2025 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W.
Suite 821
Washington, D.C. 20006

Henry Goldberg W. Kenneth Fee Attorneys for Optel Goldberg Codles Weiner & Wright 1229 19th Street, N.W. Washington, D.C. 20036

Susan Gateley
Susan Baldwin
Economics and Technology, Inc.
One Washington Mall
Boston, MA 02108

William J. Celio Ronald Choura Michigan PSC 6545 Mercantile Way lansing, MI 48910

Stephen M. Shipiro Mayer Brown & Platt 190 South LaSalle Street Chicago, IL 60603